PASCAL International Observatory

Briefing Paper 21, published in collaboration with the Centre for Research in Adult and Lifelong Learning, University of Glasgow

Impact – Playing the Long Game

Michael Osborne, Professor of Adult and Lifelong Learning, University of Glasgow

Abstract

This Briefing Paper assesses the cumulative effect of research that has systematically measured, mapped and analysed learning provision at urban/regional level, contributing internationally to developing learning cities over decades. It argues that this work has enhanced exchange between organisations generating knowledge that contributes to social, cultural and economic development, and city/regional authorities, through research-informed practice, and that Its recommendations have laid foundations for permanent structures to facilitate comprehensive mobilisation of learning resources. It has paid particular attention to mapping systematically the contribution of the HE sector to urban/regional development, and facilitating improved knowledge mobilisation and exchange. This research has been internationally influential in UNESCO's development of the Global Network of Learning Cities (GNLC).. The case of the Pécs (Hungary) illustrates the cumulative effect of research in facilitating city-wide inclusive informal lifelong learning opportunities, through exploiting cultural assets. Further impact is demonstrated in the adaption of UoG's research in cities in both the global south (Duhok, Harare and Manila), and the global north (Glasgow, Jämtland Region and Melbourne).

The paper also illustrates the ways in which the connections developed through impactful research can have further spin-offs.

1. Introduction

The impact of research beyond academia has been core to the work of UK universities, particular in the last decade when it has been one of the metrics by which quality of research has been measured in the Research Excellence Framework (REF). This framework states that impact is 'an effect on, change or benefit to the economy, society, culture, public policy or services, health, the environment or quality of life, beyond academia'[1], and is assessed against two criteria: reach and significance. Funders of research have also included impact in their measure of quality of applications for grants. For example, until recently in the UK, this took the *form* of 'Pathways to Impact' elements of funding bids to research councils such as the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC). The Australian Research Council (ARC) defines impact as 'the contribution that research makes to the economy, society, environment or culture, beyond the contribution to academic research', and uses the concept in it analysis of the outcomes of research that it funds[2].

The focus of this account of impact is the concept of learning cities/regions, places within which stakeholders across sectors of education, businesses, the public sector, cultural organisations and NGOs co-operate to create cohesive and inclusive learning frameworks for all citizens to enable educational progression. They are one of three primary vehicles of UNESCO for the promotion of lifelong learning internationally (UIL 2013, 2014). Their focus on cities reflects rapid and accelerating urbanisation, and the associated challenges of poverty, crime, environmental risks, poor health and inequitable access to learning. It is also a recognition that learning, living productive lives and inclusion are intimately connected, and require localised initiatives and joined up policy initiatives.

Over two decades a University of Glasgow team operating within and alongside the PASCAL Observatory, which is hosted by its Centre for Research and Development in Adult and Lifelong Learning (CR&DALL), have played a leading role internationally in learning city/region development. This has included key contributions to both UNESCO's strategic work and the targeted interventions of individual cities. Through a succession of research projects, they have:

- created and applied indicators of stakeholders' contributions to urban/regional development
- mapped the particular role of HEIs, supporting and shaping their strategic responses to stakeholder demands in cities and regions
- operationalised learning city indicators through creating metrics
- created international networks of learning cities for research-informed knowledge exchange

A number of core staff members within CR&DALL have been involved in this work, including Michael Osborne, Lavinia Hirsu, Kasia Borkowska, Muir Houston, Lynette Jordan, Catherine Lido, Maggie McColl, Jo Neary, Yulia Nesterova and Kate Reid and with additional inputs from visiting professors Chris Duke, Roberta Piazza and Bruce Wilson, PASCAL Associates, Peter Kearns and Norman Longworth, and honorary staff members John Tibbitt, Rob Mark and Robert Hamilton, doctoral student Sergio Hernandez and colleagues from other Schools within the University of Glasgow, including Bridgette Wessels..

2. The Research

This research has had three strands.

---

[1] See https://ref.ac.uk/guidance-on-results/guidance-on-ref-2021-results/
[2] See https://www.arc.gov.au/about-arc/strategies/research-impact-principles-and-framework

i) Development of Learning City/Region Indicators at organisational level.

Since 2002, the research contribution of this work has underpinned the creation and implementation of indicators to specify and map the contribution of stakeholders, including HEIs, to the development of learning cities. This work began at the University of Stirling through projects funded by the European Commission: R3L Indicators, PENR3L and LILARA. The Indicators project was one of 17 inter-regional networks funded by the European Commission under its Regions of Lifelong Learning Programme (R3L), and created stakeholder audits of the contribution to lifelong of each of Local and Regional Authority Administrations, schools, Adult Vocational Education establishments, Universities and Small and medium-sized enterprises in five cities across Europe. The LILARA (Learning in Local and Regional Authorities) project audited 'the needs and desires of local and regional authority employees for knowledge and learning about the future of their authorities as learning cities and regions' (Longworth and Osborne 2010: 391). Its rationale was underpinned by the concept of Total Quality Management (TQM), the idea of embedding a permanent focus on continuously improving products and services, and itself linked to the rise in New Public Management (NPM) Models (see Vinni 2007). PENR3L (the PASCAL European Network of Lifelong Learning Regions) sought to create a set of experts in learning city and region development in 25 countries in Europe, and led in 2006 to the Limerick Declaration on Learning Cities[3].

From 2008-2012 when the PASCAL Observatory relocated to the University of Glasgow, this work continued with the development of existing audit tools, translating and testing these in different sectors, including schools, adult education institutions, local authorities and universities, and the creation of a repository of good practices in learning city development in Europe (*Eurolocal* project funded by the EC) [Jordan, Longworth and Osborne 2012]. In the *R3L+* project, also funded by the EC, a research team undertook a 6-country comparative analysis of best practice tools to quality assure and improve learning networks, based on measures of partnership, participation, performance and learning culture [Eckert et al 2012].

ii) Mapping the Regional Engagement Role of HEIs.

The PASCAL Universities Regional Engagement (PURE) project [Duke, Osborne and Wilson 2013], led from UoG ran from 2008-2014 and was funded by 17 city and regional governments across four continents. PURE research identified policy barriers at institutional, regional and national level to HEI engagement with regional stakeholders as well as potential enabling strategies. Project findings have underpinned conceptual and strategic thinking as to how HEI systems can effectively contribute to sustainable and equitable socio-economic, environmental and cultural development of city/regions, most especially by working alongside other key actors.

PURE used collaborative and consultative measurement processes to support development over a three-year period in each region. This involved:

- The creation of semi-structured interviews for use with key stakeholders and consequent development of self-assessment instruments to be used by regions.
- The co-design of Action Plans with a reference group representing the university sector and representatives of its regional ecosystem.
- Monitoring and feeding back progress to regions.
- Twinning of regions, and following thematic analysis of regional needs and demands, the development of thematic knowledge clusters led by regions with common interests.

---

[3] See Limerick Declaration on Learning Cities, http://pobs.cc/1fmpc

- Benchmarking tools for both HEIs and cities/regions to assess opportunities and gaps in provision].

The research base and impact methods of PURE have been adapted methodologically and made culturally appropriate for incorporation into firstly a SFC-funded Global Challenges Research Fund (GCRF) pilot project, *Strengthening the Regional Engagement Role of Universities in Africa and Asia,* and a subsequent major British Academy GCRF funded project, *Strengthening Urban Engagement of Universities in Africa and Asia* (SUEUAA), from 2017-2019 [Neary and Osborne 2018] in six cities in Iran, Iraq, the Philippines, South Africa, Tanzania and Zimbabwe. This has led to the development of new platforms for knowledge exchange between HEIs and city stakeholders focusing on particular local urbanisation challenges[4]. This is in line with the strong international development focus of educational research at UoG.

The approach was also used in studies of the role of vocational education in city development in Hong Kong, Italy, Scotland and Taiwan via an ESRC Impact Acceleration Account (IAA) award, *Promoting Community Engagement for Vocational, Professional, Education and Training* from 2017-2018. In a number of these countries new relationships have been formalised through the development of new platforms for knowledge exchange between HEIs and city stakeholders focusing on particular local challenges, for example in Dar es Saleem and Harare through the active engagement of the Deputy Mayor and Town Clerk respectively.

iii) Operationalising Learning City Indicators. The work of the ESRC-funded Urban Big Data Centre (UBDC) with Osborne, Houston and Lido as Co-Is (2014–present) has taken the field of learning city indicators further. It operationalised a selection of the 42 Key Features for learning cities of UNESCO's Global Network of Learning Cities (GNLC) framework by creating valid and reliable metrics. This has led to a seat on the UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) expert panel on Lifelong Learning metrics for Catherine Lido. This Glasgow-based research involved a novel multi-method data capture of learning in Glasgow, with a large-scale 1600 household survey GPS, image capture and social media analysis, comprising an Integrated Multimedia City Data (iMCD) project [Lido, Reid and Osborne 2018; Thakuriah *et al*. 2020], and has informed approaches to collection of data through collaboration with UIL.

3. The Outcomes

Underpinning UNESCO 'learning cities'

A research group within PASCAL has been instrumental in furthering the learning cities concept since 2002 with a particular focus on researching and developing metrics and measurement tools as illustrated in Section 2. This research has been the basis for establishing research-informed knowledge exchange networks of learning cities. Since 2011 PASCAL has operated networks that link cities globally. In its Learning City Networks (LCN) led from UoG by Osborne, Mark and Lido, some 50 cities and other organisations are facilitated in such exchanges within seven thematic clusters, a model subsequently replicated by UNESCO. UoG research and development has contributed substantially to subsequent UNESCO's developments as outlined by the former Director of the UNESCO Institute of Lifelong Learning, David Atchoarena[5] who has stated:

---

[4] See also http://sueuaa.com
[5] Personal Communication from former Director of the UNESCO Institute of Lifelong Learning, David Atchoarena, 31 August 2020

> *… at the UNESCO Institute for Lifelong, as we were developing a Learning City agenda, we became aware of the extensive and longstanding work, led by Professor Osborne. We were thus assured that Professor Osborne was a leader in Learning City Development and in particular the creation of indicators. As a result of this University of Glasgow research, Professor Osborne was appointed to the Expert Group that established UNESCO's Global Network of Learning Cities in 2012, and which created and validated the 42 Key Features for Learning Cities in October 2013. UofG research helped determine the metrics and measurement tools now embedded in the UNESCO learning cities framework. This was particularly the case in metrics that were established to determine the contributions of various stakeholders (schools, colleges, universities, businesses and the NGO sector) in learning city development and sustenance, the core element of his previous work. Following piloting, from 2014 onwards, the framework of Key Features of Learning Cities[6] has been used as one of the guiding documents for applicants to join UNESCO's Global Network of Learning Cities (GNLC) and as the basis for cities to obtain Learning City Awards.*

There are now 292 members of the network in 76 countries, with 12 cities receiving the award in 2015 (including Pecs highlighted below), 16 in 2017, 12 in 2019 and 10 in 2021.

UoG research has continued to shape UNESCO's developments. It has supported, amongst others, the cities of Cork and Pecs, members of the PASCAL's Learning Cities Network, in their applications to gain UNESCO learning city awards, and other cities such as Glasgow, Trieste and Wolverhampton to join UNESCO's GNLC.

Atchoarena further states:

> *In subsequent work from 2015 onwards we have been pleased to continue our collaboration. UofG researchers (Professor Osborne and Professor Catherine Lido) have continued to shape UNESCO's approach through invited inputs to its biennial learning cities conferences in Mexico City (2015), Cork (2017) and Medellin (2019). Professor Osborne produced a guiding background paper on learning cities and inclusion for the Medellin conference[7], and Professor Lido a further specific background paper on digital inclusion[8]. By virtue of the world-leading research work of Urban Big Data Centre at the University of Glasgow, they have operationalised a number of the key indicators of our key features and have presented alternative methods for data collection (e.g. GPS and lifelogging) in pursuit of the development of these indicators to monitor and evaluate lifelong learning implementation at urban level[9]*

These research approaches have been incorporated into a 6-webinar series for cities led by Osborne and Lido in collaboration with and for UNESCO and its GNLC membership in 2020, *Learning Cities' COVID-19 Recovery; from research to practice[10]* with up to 500 participants per event.

---

[6] See Introductory Note on Key Features. Available at https://uil.unesco.org/lifelong-learning/learning-cities/key-features-learning-cities. See also https://uil.unesco.org/lifelong-learning/learning-cities for an overview of the learning cities initiative.

[7] Osborne, M. and Hernandez, S. (2019) Sustainable Learning Cities: Inclusion, Equity and Lifelong Learning. Available at https://uil.unesco.org/system/files/iclc2019_backgroundpaper_final_en.pdf

[8] Lido, C., Hirsu, L. and Wessels, B. (2019) Learning Cities and Digital Inclusion Available at https://uil.unesco.org/system/files/iclc2019_backgroundpaper_final_en.pdf

[9] Report of International Roundtable on Developing indicators to monitor and evaluate lifelong learning implementation. Inst. for Adult Ed., Singapore with UNESCO, 1-2 July 2019 (p 9 and 14)

[10] PASCAL/UIL Webinar series "Learning Cities' COVID-19 recovery: from research to practice" *Overview* available at https://uil.unesco.org/event/new-webinar-series-learning-cities-covid-19-recovery-research-practice with

In 2020, by virtue of his research into, and mapping of the contribution of universities to lifelong learning, Osborne was appointed as an advisor to a major project supported by UIL and the Shanghai Open University, The Role of Higher Education Institutions for Lifelong Learning[11], during 2020-21.

Pécs: improving lifelong learning

Of the numerous available urban cases that of the city of Pécs illustrates the substantial impact of UofG research derived indicators. At the outset of this work, Hungary was a former socialist country still in transition, its educational and civic institutions lacking autonomy in a still highly centralised system. The challenge was to lever the assets of these institutions, particularly the university sector to promote balanced social, economic and cultural development[12]. A clear pathway from research to impact developed from 2005 onwards.

LILARA determined learning needs and demands of the city/region, with this work disseminated at the 5th PASCAL conference in Pécs (Life-Long Learning in the City-Region) in 2007. In parallel, Eurolocal determined learning contributions being made by stakeholders. R3L+ from 2008-2011, provided quality indicators for developing a learning culture around the PPP (partnership, participation, performance) model, resulting in the implementation of a learning region model and helped the two universities in Pécs to recognise the importance of initiating projects on local and regional development. The application of these tools and the analysis of the role of the University sector (the PURE project led from UoG from 2008-2013) in promoting and supporting development, led to the county and city authorities, and their two universities working together through a Regional Forum. The forum created a new joint action plan with a co-ordinated structure involving a breadth of stakeholders (civil society organisations, NGOs and private institutions) to effectively leverage university assets in advancing development.

Of many recommendations of PURE, those to grow and enhance lifelong learning and to create a city-based cultural and heritage cluster have had particular impact. These led directly to the foundation of the Pécs Learning Festival, the annual programme of informal adult learning, including the Senior Academy project in 2016. The festival exploits the cultural assets of the city (its Knowledge Centre, the House of Civil Communities, the Janus Pannonius Museum and the Zsolnay Cultural Quarter) with a focus on the inclusion of those from the most deprived neighbourhoods, minority groups and older adults. The 1st Learning Festival in 2017 involved 73 organisations offering 141 programmes at 11 sites attracting 3200 participants. In 2018, 76 organisations/institutions offered 130 programmes at 25 sites with 8000 participants[13]. The Senior Academy project gives more than 500 older learners annually the opportunity to improve their skills and knowledge.

These innovations were a major factor in the award of the UNESCO Learning City Award in 2017[14]. Dr Zsolt Páva, mayor of the city, attributed these developments to UoG's '*significant role in enabling the*

---

programme, reports of each webinar and links to recording of each webinar on UIL YouTube channel. All reports and recordings available

[11] See https://www.uil.unesco.org/en/higher-education-lifelong-learning. Other collaborating partners were the UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (UNESCO–IIEP) and the UNESCO International Institute for Higher Education in Latin America and the Caribbean (UNESCO–IESALC), and the wider university sector through the International Association of Universities (IAU).

[12] See PURE Regional Briefing Paper for South Transdanubia
http://pure.pascalobservatory.org/library/pure/rbp-south-transdanubia

[13] See UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning Webpage- Pecs

[14] From application by Pécs for UNESCO Global Learning City Award 2017

city of Pécs to prepare and, namely, to successfully bid for the title and Award … in 2016'[15]. This outcome is the culmination of a long-term programme of research co-operation with the UoG, which led to Pécs' success in creating a shared culture of lifelong learning among its citizens.

Jämtland Region and the Jamtli Foundation – capitalising on cultural assets for learning

The Jämtland Region centred on Östersund in mid-Sweden was one of the PURE project regions[16], where the focus that emerged from research, in response to stakeholder analysis, was cultural and creative industries and tourism, since these were important sectors in the region with great potential for both economic growth, and for social inclusion. A particular issue that emerged in this region was limited contribution of its one university to regional challenges, and the need for the region to engage internationally. This has been particularly evident in region's main cultural asset, the Jamtli Foundation, which based on the PURE project findings has expanded its remit based on principles of lifelong learning and social inclusion. It has, for example, introduced programmes concerned with labour market re-integration, provision for migrants and for people with dementia, and it attributes these developments to the foundations laid down by PURE.

> *The Jamtli museum is relatively big for the region as it has approximately 120 employees in a region with only 130 000 inhabitants. That has only been possible to develop and sustain because of the professionalization of the visitor service and by following the advice from Pascal to broaden the work field of the museum. Today the museum attracts almost 30 percent more visitors than 15 years ago and works with social inclusion, re-introduction to labor market, Swedish for immigrants programs, reminiscence programs for people with early dementia symptoms and many other activities which was non-existing not so many years ago. (Henrik Zipsane, former CEO of Jamtli Foundation)[17]*

Melbourne: facilitating access for disadvantaged students

Melbourne's participation in PURE was established under the auspices of the Office of Knowledge Capital and the City of Melbourne, and with support from all eight Melbourne universities and the Government of Victoria. Some 14 case studies of engagement activity were undertaken across the three themes of regional innovation, green jobs and social inclusion. The establishment of the Hume Multiversity in 2012 was the most significant outcome, and directly links to knowledge exchange that the PURE approach facilitated with another of its regions, the Thames Gateway The Multiversity is a collaboration between 8 Tertiary Institutions, education providers and industry bodies that is located in the Hume municipality, improving community educational aspirations and facilitating lifelong learning by making tertiary education and training opportunities more accessible to Hume residents, and continues its work to the present time[18]. With an investment of A$130k by Hume City Council for a Multiversity Engagement Officer and related costs, as well as significant investments by partners, in 2018/19 the Multiversity enrolled 333 students[19].

> *Professor Michael Osborne, at the University of Glasgow, in his role as Project Leader of the Pascal Universities and Regional Engagement (PURE) project, has played a significant role in enabling Hume City Council, in Victoria, Australia, to establish the Multiversity initiative. The*

---

[15] Personal Communication from Dr Zsolt Páva, Mayor of the City of Pecs, 24 January 2019
[16] See PURE Regional Briefing Paper for Jämtland - http://pobs.cc/1kbuv
[17] Personal Communication from Dr Henrik Zipsane, President of the European Museum Academy and former CEO of Jamtli Foundation, 20 July 2020
[18] See PURE Regional Briefing Paper for Melbourne City - http://pobs.cc/1kbv7
[19] Personal Communication from George Osborne, Manager Economic Development, Hume City, 8 February 2019

Multiversity has been an important part of Council's strategy in improve its citizens' circumstances, through supporting increased participation in higher education by improving local access. The establishment of the Hume Multiversity was a tangible outcome of the international research and innovation collaboration between regions that was central to the PURE project. (George Osborne, Manager Economic Development, Hume City)

Glasgow: Operationalising Learning City Indicators and improving literacy inclusion

Key features of the learning cities approach were operationalised within a 2015 survey administered to some 1600 Glasgow households as part of work of the Integrated Multimedia City Data Project (iMCD), which also utilised novel GPS tracking, a travel diary and social media capture. Following this work, the Urban Big Data Centre sought to make iMCD data on lifewide literacies accessible to the public through its re-use as visualisations and 3-D objects, including 'literacy badges' and jigsaws, which mediate active interrogation of data by citizens. These materials have been used in a number of public events since 2017. For instance, at the ESRC Festival of Science, held at IKEA in Glasgow, an inter-generational audience of 1000 people engaged with this material, and 130 children made and took home a literacy badge[20]. Public outreach has also taken place at the Glasgow Science Festival (2017) and MoSSfest (2018). This work engaged hundreds of families in conversations around learning cities and literacy inclusion, and 25 schools entered a schools' visit competition.

This UofG research also has informed Glasgow City Council's application for membership of the UNESCO Learning City Network obtained in 2019 through providing comprehensive data on participation in formal, non-formal and informal lifelong learning in the city and GU are supporting next steps necessary for the city to obtain the UNESCO Learning City Award through advice being offered as part of its UNESCO Learning City Advisory Board[21].

Further, the iMCD data is an eligible dataset for the ESRC's Secondary Data Analysis Initiative[22], and has been requested by 699 users through UBDC's Data Service[23].

The city of Glasgow's work in this field received international attention through a case study published by UIL (2021) of learning city responses to COVID-19.

Further International Reach

The international reach of UofG-based research has also influenced planning and development in cities in the global south, with further evidenced impact from the SUEUAA project in Duhok (Iraqi, Kurdistan), Harare and Manila. This work demonstrates the breadth of impact not only internationally, but also into inter-disciplinary domains where higher education institutions can contribute to some of the world's most difficult challenges. The systematic identification of mismatches in supply and demand between universities and cities through the SUEUAA Project has led to a) a research collaboration on the environmental impact of conflict and landmine clearance between the University

---

[20] See a blog that reports this work at http://ubdc.ac.uk/news-media/2017/november/adventures-in-design-and-data-how-good-design-took-big-data-to-ikea/

[21] See https://glasgowlearningcity.co.uk for an account of the work of the city of Glasgow and its partners in learning city development

[22] See https://www.ukri.org/opportunity/secondary-data-analysis-initiative/

[23] See https://www.ubdc.ac.uk/data-services/data-catalogue/integrated-multimedia-city-data-imcd/imcd-project-glasgow-household-survey-and-travel-diary-data/

of Duhok and the city's Landmine department[24], b) the renewal of a Memorandum of Agreement that embraces all faculties at the University of Zimbabwe and all departments at the City of Harare, in the context of major health, environmental, food security and skills challenges[25] and c) the establishment of a Memorandum of Agreement concerning community engagement between Philippines Normal University and seven barangays (smallest political unit in the Philippines) and three NGOs[26]. Mr. Hasan Hussein Ali, Deputy General of Administration and Finance at the Duhok General Directorate of Mines Action, reports that because of the work conducted in Duhok during the SUEUAA project that:

> '*This is the first time through this project that we have established a working relationship with University of Duhok. We are in the process of establishing research collaborations with University of Duhok on the effect of landmines in the Kurdish region of Iraq on society, health, safety, environment, agriculture, tourism and economy. We have a plan to discuss with the University of Duhok the establishment of an institute of landmine education.*

The President of the University of Duhok reports on a number of significant health-related contributions in the context of COVID-19 to the city and the Duhok governorate, that are '*a direct result of the research that was carried out during the SUEUAA project, which systematically mapped and assessed the extent and effectiveness of engagements between our university and cit*y' .

4. Continuing Influence

One thing can lead to another, but that is not automatically the case and neither can all developments be completely planned. Often further development occurs through having in mind an outline set of goals, and recognising and seizing opportunities when they appear. These are characteristics of an entrepreneur. In this case it is not academic entrepreneurship in the traditional sense of looking for commercial opportunities through technology transfer, patenting, licensing or creating spin-off start-up companies (see Balven, Fenters, Siegal and Waldman 2018); rather this is entrepreneurship with a social dimension that seeks to make a difference socially in some of the ways intended by UK Funding Agencies for Higher Education. And with the emphasis of much of this endeavour being on working with the global south, is in accord with traditions in some of these countries (see Roncancio-Marin 2022), which are sometimes overlooked in our zealous intentions of making a difference through engagement[27].

In the case of this strand of work, continuing impact has involved consideration of the breadth of funded opportunities that exist in the UK and beyond, and how these can be levered to support further work. Most notable have been opportunities offered by the European Commission, some of which continued beyond the exit of the UK from the European Union and still exist, and UK-based funding agencies. Continuing work is also being facilitated by capitalising on existing infrastructure at the University of Glasgow, integrating both the work and collaborators of previously funded projects into longstanding and stable programmes of work. Too often when funded projects end, there is a loss of the academic capital that has been built up. This is manifest in the loss of professional networking

---

[24] Personal Communications with Dr Mosleh Duhoky, former President of University of Duhok, Iraq of 4/2/19 and 9/11/20, and a statement by Hasan Hussein Ali, Deputy General of Administration and Finance at the Duhok General Directorate of Mines Action, which is found at http://pobs.cc/1my3h

[25] See SUEUAA Final Report for Harare at http://pobs.cc/1n593

[26] See SUEUAA Final Report for Manila http://pobs.cc/1n595

[27] The social purpose of universities arguably has longer and deeper history in 'less-developed' countries. An oft-quoted example is the 1918 Córdoba Reform Movement in Argentina which paved the way across the continent for reforms that included engagement with disadvantaged communities being at the ore of the work of universities (Pitton and Britez 2009).

capability, staff exchanges and related enhancement of research skills that are the result of networking and exchange.

Examples of such developments at a European level include work facilitated within the university's Erasmus+ Institutional Credit Mobility (ICM) Programme and its Erasmus Mundus Masters Programmes. ICM[28] supports the mobility of both staff and students from programme countries (largely EU countries) to any other country in the world and vice-versa. The UK is no longer a programme country, but was until July 2022, and in preceding years, the University of Glasgow operated an extensive set of activities, which included mobilities to and from Iraq (University of Duhok) and Zimbabwe (University of Zimbabwe) that spun-off the work of the SUEUAA project. These mobilities from 2020 to 2023 sought to consolidate the work of SUEUAA by embedding practices of community engagement into the fabric of these universities with a view to these then being cascaded into other HEIs in the country. In the case of Iraq, this cascading effect has extended to informing the development of research capacity in universities across the autonomous region of Kurdistan, and providing advice on the setting up of a regional research council in 2024.

The coordinators of the PASCAL Learning City Network on heritage and museum education have been staff members from the University of Glasgow and the European Museum Academy. This joint activity has been part of the genesis of two developments: a two-year international Masters in Education in Museums and Heritage (EDUMaH)[29] supported under the Erasmus Mundus Scheme, and with other colleagues from Smithsonian Institute constituting an editorial team for an upcoming International Handbook in Museums and Heritage Education which is planned for publication by Routledge in 2024.

The connectivity of the PASCAL LCN and of SUEUAA is also demonstrated in the work of two visiting researchers who have been funded by UK agencies. Ievgeniia Dragomirova is funded from 2022 to 2025 under the British Academy's Researchers at Risk scheme for Ukrainian academics, having previously represented the city of Mariupol within the LCN. She is currently researching the learning experiences of third age migrants in the UK. Nematollah Azizi from the University of Kurdistan in Iran, who was a collaborator in SUEUAA has been visiting professorship at the University of Glasgow, funded by the Leverhulme Trust from 2023-2024. The core aim of his programme of research has been to enhance understanding of how universities can better contribute to sustainable economic, social and cultural development of their host cities through analysis of distinct approaches that have been taken in Iran in the context of Islamic thinking around culture and spirituality, identifying practices that are transferable to the UK. He also seeks to explore potentially transferability of practices from the UK to Iran.

The final illustration of impact relates extensively to a project not previously mentioned, but does relate to the work of the PASCAL Observatory and SUEUAA. The Centre for Sustainable, Healthy, Learning Cities and Neighbourhoods was a major project funded through UKRI's "Growing Research Capability to Meet the Challenges Faced by Developing Countries" programme within its Global Challenges Research Fund (GCRF) portfolio (see Osborne 2023) from 2017-2022. Amongst the partners in this centre were the University of the Philippines and the University of Khulna in Bangladesh. As well as their engagement in the core research work of the centre, each of these universities was funded through SHLC's Capacity Development Acceleration Fund in a collaborative project as part of the UNESCO's International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) programme, *Local Challenges, Global*

---

[28] See this link for a description of the current programme -
https://www.erasmusplus.org.il/sites/erasmus2/UserContent/files/ICM%20Handbook.pdf
[29] See https://www.gla.ac.uk/postgraduate/erasmusmundus/edumah/

Imperatives: Cities at the Forefront to Achieve the Education 2030 Agenda[30]. This project examined the ways cities conduct educational planning and management. Collectively the core research of SHLC to study the link between education, health and sustainability with neighbourhoods in global south cities, and the specific work of the CDAF project created considerable interest in these universities in establishing longer-lasting infra-structures to continue this work. The vehicle for doing so has been PASCAL with the University of the Philippines now hosting PASCAL Asia-Pacific, with the University if Khulna as an Associate Centre. A further Associate Centre has been established at the University of Duhok, a partner in SUEUAA.

References

Balven, R., Fenters, V., Siegal, D.S. and Waldman, D. (2018) Academic Entrepreneurship: the role of Identity, Motivation, Championing, Education, Work-life Balance and Organizational Justice. *Academy of Management Perspectives 32(1): 21–42.*

Duke, C., Osborne, M. and Wilson, B. (2013) *A New Imperative: Regions and Higher Education in Difficult Times. Series: Universities and lifelong learning.* Manchester: Manchester University Press. ISBN 9780719088308

Eckert, T., Preisinger-Kleine, R., Fartusnic, C., Houston, M. , Juceviciene, P., Dillon, B., Nemeth, B., Kleisz, T., Ceseviciute, I., Thinesse-Demel, J., Osborne, M. and Wallin, E. (2012) *Quality in Developing Learning Cities and Regions: A Guide for Practitioners and Stakeholders*. Munich: Ludwig Maximilian University, ISBN 9783000373336 (doi:10.1007/978-94-007-7299-1)

Jordan, L., Longworth, N. and Osborne, M. (2014) The rise and fall and rise again of learning cities. In: Zarifis, G.K. and Gravani, M. (eds.) *Challenging the 'European Area of Lifelong Learning': A Critical Response.* Dordrecht: Springer, pp. 273-284. (doi:10.1007/978-94-007-7299-1)

Lido, C. , Reid, K. and Osborne, M. (2019) Lifewide Learning in the City: Novel big data approaches to exploring learning with large-scale surveys, GPS & social media. *Oxford Review of Education*, 45(2), 279-295. (doi: 10.1080/03054985.2018.1554531)

Longworth, N. and Osborne, M. (2010) Six Ages towards a Learning Region - A Retrospective, *European Journal of Education*, 45 (3): 368-401

Neary, J. and Osborne, M. (2018) University engagement in achieving sustainable development goals: a synthesis of case studies from the SUEUAA study. *Australian Journal of Adult Learning*, 58(3), 336-364

Osborne, M. (2023) Strengthening Capacity to Address Urban, Health and Education Challenges in Fast-Growing Cities and Neighbourhoods. And Social Justice: International Perspectives. In M. Slowey, Hinzen, H., Omolewa, M. and Osborne, M. (Eds.), *Adult Education and Social Justice: International Perspectives*. Florence: Florence University Press, pp. 175-189,

Pitton, V.O. and Britez, R.G. (2009) Higher Education Policies in Latin America: changes and continuities. *Policy Futures in Education*, 7(5): 455-462

---

[30] See https://www.iiep.unesco.org/en/our-expertise/cities-and-education-2030-local-challenges-global-imperatives#:~:text=Cities%20play%20a%20leading%20role,universal%20access%20to%20quality%20education.

Roncancio-Marin, J.J., Dentchev, N.A., Guerrero, M. and Diaz-Gonzalez, A.A. (2022), Shaping the social orientation of academic entrepreneurship: an exploratory study, *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 28(7): 1679-1701.

Thakuriah, P. (V.), Sila-Nowicka, K. , Hong, J. , Boididou, C., Osborne, M. , Lido, C. and McHugh, A. (2020) Integrated Multimedia City Data (iMCD): a composite survey and sensing approach to understanding urban living and mobility. Computers, Environment and Urban Systems 80, 101427. (doi: 10.1016/j.compenvurbsys.2019.101427

UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) (2013). *Terms of Reference for Establishing the International Platform for Learning Cities*. Hamburg: UIL

UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) (2014) *Lifelong learning for all: Inclusion, prosperity and sustainability in cities*. Conference Report, 21-23 October 2013, Beijing, China, Hamburg

UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) (2021) *Snapshots of learning cities' responses to COVID-19*. Available at https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000378050

Vinni, R (2007) Total Quality Management and Paradigms of Public Administration. *International Public Management Review* 8(1): 103-131

Michael Osborne is Professor of Adult and Lifelong Learning at the University of Glasgow, and Director of the **Centre for Research and Development in Adult and Lifelong Learning** within the School of Education. He is also the European Director of the **PASCAL Observatory** on Place Management, Social Capital and Lifelong Learning. His main interests in research are: the role of education in international development, urban big data, universities' engagement with communities, widening participation to higher education, teaching and learning in higher education, the VET/HE interface and the development of learning cities and regions. He is a Co-I within the ESRC funded **Urban Big Data Centre** within which he has worked on projects concerned with education, place and disadvantage, and on learning city metrics. He has been PI of the British Academy GCRF funded **Strengthening Urban Engagement of Universities in Africa and Asia** project. He has also been Co-I within the UKRI GCRF funded Global **Centre for Sustainable, Healthy Learning Cities and Neighbourhoods.**

He has worked closely with UNESCO's **Institute for Lifelong Learning** (UIL) and its International **Institute for Educational Planning** (IIEP). With UIL he has been an adviser in the development of their Global Learning Cities Network. He produced the main Briefing Paper for the 2019 4th International Conference on Learning Cities in Medellin and has also produced one of the three Briefing Papers for its 5th conference in Korea in 2021 on Education, Health and Resilience in cites post-COVID-19. With IIEP he is working within a project that considers how lifelong learning contributes to urban planning.
He is Co-Chair of the International Advisory Board of the **Asia Pacific Learning Cities Alliance** in the Republic of Korea. He is a convenor of the **Asia Europe Meeting Lifelong Learning (ASEM LLL)** Hub's research network on Lifelong Learning policies**.**